



UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA PRESS
JOURNALS + DIGITAL PUBLISHING

The United States Marshals of New Mexico and Arizona Territories, 1846-1912 by Larry D. Ball; Gunpowder Justice: A Reassessment of the Texas Rangers by Julian Samora; Joe Bernal; Albert Pena

Review by: David J. Bodenhamer

Pacific Historical Review, Vol. 50, No. 1 (Feb., 1981), pp. 114-115

Published by: [University of California Press](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3639353>

Accessed: 13/04/2014 23:52

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



University of California Press is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Pacific Historical Review*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

It is hoped that *Historical Atlas of Arizona* will be reprinted from time to time so that current data can be added and errors corrected. When the Hopi-Navajo land dispute is finally settled, for example, a change will be needed on the map depicting Indian reservations. (The same map should also show the location of the Tonto-Apache reservation near Payson.) Fortunately, the book's design is such that modification can be made with relative ease.

The author and cartographer of this long-awaited atlas have made a monumental contribution to Arizoniana. Their atlas should be on every western history and geography bookshelf.

JAY J. WAGONER

East High School, Phoenix, Arizona

The United States Marshals of New Mexico and Arizona Territories, 1846–1912. By LARRY D. BALL. (Albuquerque, University of New Mexico Press, 1978. x + 315 pp. \$12.50)

Gunpowder Justice: A Reassessment of the Texas Rangers. By JULIAN SAMORA, JOE BERNAL, and ALBERT PENA. (Notre Dame, Ind., Notre Dame Press, 1979. 179 pp. \$10.95)

The western United States marshal has long been an American folk hero. Perhaps best personified by Matt Dillon, the protagonist of the popular television series *Gunsmoke*, the marshal was a rugged, honest, nonpartisan, and peace-loving man who relied on persuasion and the six-gun to bring order and justice to the West.

This romantic popular image is challenged by Larry Ball, who offers a more realistic portrait in his revisionist study of U.S. marshals in the southwest territories. These officers were men of affairs and middle-class property-holders from the East who, not surprisingly, sought partisan or economic advantage from their appointments. Yet Ball finds that many of them worked diligently to bring the new federal order to a sprawling environment and to a sometimes hostile populace. The marshals had only partial success, however, because they faced problems unique to the West—especially those caused by distance and cultural conflict—with limited powers inherited from their predecessors in the cis-Mississippi territories.

Like his marshals, Ball's study offers a mixed bag to historians. His research is superb; few sources have escaped his scrutiny. And he places this research into its broader historical context. For example, he discusses the increasing bureaucratic demands of the Department of Justice in terms of what Robert Wiebe has called the "search for order." Finally, Ball does not claim too much for his subjects. He recognizes that much of their work was routine and that other institutions, notably the U.S. Army, were also important in maintaining order.

There are two major flaws in this otherwise creditable book. First, the organization Ball adopts (chronological by territory) sometimes results in an uncritical and dry narrative of events involving marshals. One problem with this approach is that the reader is uncertain of the marshals' real importance in territorial government. A better treatment would have examined the office by function. Second, the study fails to analyze systematically the socioeconomic character of the marshals as a group. The use of standard prosopographical techniques would have strengthened this part of the work considerably.

Even with its faults, Ball's study is far superior to *Gunpowder Justice*. Subtitled *A Reassessment of the Texas Rangers*, the book has only the slightest connection with historical scholarship. It relies almost exclusively on secondary sources, it proceeds from questionable assumptions, and it contains little analysis. Its conclusions reflect the authors' biases (the preface reveals their preferred title, *Los Rinches*—"pigs"): "The Rangers were organized . . . to suppress already oppressed minorities"; and "The Rangers have historically been a lawless breed of men . . ." (p. 165). These statements may be true, but careful historians will want to await the verdict of more critical scholarship.

DAVID J. BODENHAMER

University of Southern Mississippi

George Catlin: Episodes from Life among the Indians and Last Rambles.
 Edited by MARVIN C. ROSS. (Norman, University of Oklahoma Press, 1979. xiv + 354 pp. \$25)

George Catlin is an important book, and all western art and American Indian buffs owe editor Marvin C. Ross and the publisher a debt of gratitude for making it available. The editor has provided an informative introduction and shown restraint in editing two of Catlin's books for young people that were published in England in the 1860s and that are not well known over here. *Life among the Indians: A Book for Youth* (London, 1861) and *Last Rambles amongst the Indians of the Rocky Mountains and the Andes* (London, 1866) resulted from an extended visit, 1852–1855, among the Indians of South America and those tribes west of the Rocky Mountains in North America. Later in 1855 and in 1857 Catlin made other trips to South and Central America. Many of the paintings he made on Bristol board (Catlin explains the switch from canvas in the appendix of his 1871 exhibition catalog) on these trips in the 1850s have never before been reproduced. One hundred and sixty-three illustrations, including twelve in color, from the trips made in the 1850s are included in this book. They provide an important historical record and in some cases the only pictorial record of certain tribes. Practically all the text of Catlin's two least known books